

**The Handicapping «Forgetting» of Waste Workers in the Approach of
Education to the Sustainable Development of Society**

Blandine Tchamou

Department of Education Sciences, Pasquale Paoli University Corsica, France

**Отпадъчното управление като подход в образованието за устойчиво развитие на
обществото**

Бландин Чаму

Департамент Образователни науки, Университет на Корсика „Паскал Паоли“, Франция.

Author note

Blandine Tchamou  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0881-4482>

The author declared no potential conflicts of interest concerning the authorship, and publication of this article. The author received no financial support for the authorship, and publication of this article.

The author thanks to prof. Bruno Garnier for his careful proofreading, his observations and his encouragement.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Blandine Tchamou UMR CNRS 6240 LISA, Pasquale Paoli University, 20250 Corte, Corsica, France. E-mail: blandiseolivetchamou@gmail.com

Бележки за автора

Бландин Чаму  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0881-4482>

Авторката декларира, че няма конфликт на интереси.

Авторката благодари на проф. Бруно Гарниер за насърчаването, наблюдаването и редактирането на статията.

E-mail за кореспонденция: blandiseolivetchamou@gmail.com

Abstract

Among the problems of postmodernism, the article will make a reasoned plea for waste management education for sustainable development. While some academics criticize the term "development" as a paradigm of endless utopian capitalist evolution, there is a consensus on the need to change society's relationship to the world and to adopt more appropriate behaviours. Unfortunately, waste management is not "thought" as a cultural need for education, but as a stack of sensitization actions and the prescription of an ideal of cleanliness linked to the efficiency of the function. Waste abandoned in inappropriate spaces (litter) and made 'visible' by the abandonment of masks related to the health crisis is not taken into account in expectations of improvement, creating the 'dropping out' of a large part of the population according to Vygotsky's theory in the proximal development zone. In the same movement, the sensitization action for better waste management is carried out by invisibilisation and maintaining the segregation of waste workers, present in all living areas, in contact with actual behaviour. Workers in the waste sector are ignored and invisible, even in the recent information report presented to the national assembly on "precarious" jobs in the link. Taking into account the resources offered by the educational sciences, particularly the pedagogy of decision-making could help to change the role of these professionals to improve the relationship between citizens and their waste, as is already the case in some municipalities.

Keywords: waste workers, education, littering, sustainable development, forgetting, proximal development zone

Резюме

В статията се поставя акцент върху обучението по управление на отпадъците в контекста на устойчивото развитие на обществото. Докато някои учени критикуват термина „развитие“ като парадигма на утопичната капиталистическа еволюция, съществува консенсус относно необходимостта от промяна на връзката на обществото със света и възприемане на по-подходящо поведение. За съжаление управлението на отпадъците не се „мисли“ като културна нужда от образование, а като набор от действия за повишаване на чувствителността и предписания на идеали за чистота. Отпадъците, изоставени в неподходящи пространства и направени „видими“ чрез изоставянето на маски, свързани със здравната криза, не се вземат предвид в очакванията за подобрене, създавайки „отпадане“ на голяма част от населението според теорията на Виготски в проксимална зона на развитие. В същото движение, сенсibiliзационната акция за по-добро управление на отпадъците се осъществява чрез инвизибилизация и поддържане на

сегрегация на работниците, работещи с отпадъци, присъстващи във всички жизнени райони, в контакт с действителното поведение. Работниците в сектора на отпадъците са игнорирани и дори невидими в информационните доклади относно „несигурните“ работни места, представени на високо национално ниво. Като се вземат предвид ресурсите, предлагани от образователните науки, по-специално педагогиката на вземане на решения, може да се помогне за промяна на ролята на тези професионалисти за подобряване на връзката между гражданите и техните отпадъци, какъвто вече е случаят в някои общини в Корсика. Образователната система се приема като потенциален ресурс за промяна на ролята на тези професионалисти и за подобряване на чувствителността на гражданите за потребността от по-добро управление на отпадъците.

Ключови думи: работещи с отпадъци, образование, отпадъци, устойчиво развитие, забравяне, зона на проксимално развитие

ARTICLE INFO:
Original Article
Received: 25, 07.2020
Revised: 31, 07.2020
Accepted: 20, 08.2020

**The Handicapping «Forgetting» of Waste Workers in the Approach of
Education to the Sustainable Development of Society**

The global health crisis induced by Covid19 has led a large part of the population to use masks, gloves massively, and wipes to protect themselves and others. This massive use of Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) has led it to appear in public spaces, (Martin, 2020) rivers and seas (N'daricaling, 2020). The presence of these wastes has been reported in different countries, (Malo, 2020) although "sensitive" because of the protective role they are supposed to have played for users and the dangers they represent for the rest of the population, they have been the subject of various indignation on social networks and in the media (Pennanec'h & Lecalot, 2020).

In France, an information campaign (Ministry of Ecological and Inclusive Transition, 2020) on masks' management after use has been launched, fines (Rousset, 2020) have been greatly increased. Some environmentalists have expressed concern about the lack of biodegradable masks that could be a solution to this pollution (Pedrosa, 2020). Laboratories (Yacou & Léveillé, 2020) and manufacturers around the world have embarked on research to create and produce biodegradable masks. This circumstantial "visibility" and the inconveniences caused by these wastes are the main indicators of the difficulties of the ambition carried at the local, national, and international levels. The adoption by all of an appropriate behaviour aiming at the valorization of the waste produced for sustainable development of the planet. This question of social transformation for its adaptation to the environment refers to the social acquisitions of informal and non-formal education, unfortunately lightly studied in the educational sciences, which would though be the appropriate disciplinary entry point to question and support this generalized need for the acquisition of skills to the whole population.

This article is the result of a long-lasting socio-ethnographic investigation process that began at bachelor degree in education sciences from 2013 and which, "as the investigation process progresses as well as the investigator's experience increases, something takes shape, through sedimentation and overlap" (Berger & Gayet-Viaud, 2011). It is an inquiry conducted primarily according to the methodology of grounded theorizing described by Glaser and Strauss (1967/2017) in their explanatory book *The Discovery of Grounded Theory* to describe the methodology used in writing their study of death awareness published two years earlier, which resonated with many researchers for qualitative research. It is a subject-based theory starts with concrete data and ends up translating it into an explanatory theory. "The major difference between this methodology and other approaches to qualitative research is its emphasis upon

theory development? Researchers can aim at various levels of theory when using grounded theory” (Strauss & Corbin, 1994, p.274). “Grounded theory is a general methodology, a way of thinking about and conceptualizing data”. (Ibid, p.275)

The question of the adoption by populations of appropriate waste management behaviour, which I have been studying for many years, will enable me to indicate the main orientations of researchers and critics in education sciences on the issue of sustainable development, the place of waste in education for sustainable development, the index value of waste produced as close as possible to the citizens, the issue of waste sorting as a starting point for waste recovery, the persistence of various forms of waste abandonment not taken into account in the pedagogical approach is a sign of the non-inclusion of the theory of the Proximal Development Zone in educational thinking. Yet, this waste is socially unacceptable and remains the main obstacle to any waste sorting ambition.

I would also point out that raising awareness is the preferred institutional choice to respond to the urgent need to change behaviour. Changing the position of waste collection agents seems to be the main lever in the approach of municipalities that are improving the management of their waste. The persistence of "forgetting" cleaning and waste collection agents in all these awareness-raising approaches will also be discussed. Segregation of this professional category, which is a source of multiple consequences, and makes any sustainable educational approach to waste management adapted to urban life "inoperative."

Sustainable development examined in educational sciences.

Several researchers and critics of education for sustainable development are questioning the strong economic and political dimension that goes with it. Sauv  (2008) characterizes sustainable development as a "barbaric invasion of reductive ideologies (uncultured concerning previous advances or alternatives) and hegemonic (that raze everything to the ground and impose themselves in force)". (p. 52)

Several authors highlight the pedagogical difficulties encountered in the field of practices for the implementation of education for sustainable development "SD as a container [is] less operational and less effective concerning the stated objectives" (Lange, 2017, p. 83). It is often about making with these prescriptions "Which land at the heart of national education systems" (Sauv , 2008, p. 46). Sauv  notes that "there is little critical talk on the linkage between education, environment, and development." Ibid Nevertheless, they offer a framework for legitimization: "The prescriptions of international organizations - here those of the UN via UNESCO - seem reassuring to many; it included reference points, certainties, support, and

source of legitimacy. Through a strange approval phenomenon, we are thus committed to implementing a project that has not discoursed, but that is imposed as an authority via national strategies" (ibid.).

The place of waste in sustainable development

The word "waste" is used 113 times in the Brundtland report. This word is mainly used to manage hazardous waste, particularly nuclear waste, and the report mentions international traffic aimed at abandoning it in less developed countries or dumping it in international seas. The report states that companies never calculate the cost of...pollution or waste"(Brundtland, 1987, p. 53).

The issues of sustainable development easily integrate the questions of waste management in France, as a privileged means of saving resources and their concern for sustainability is present in the circular of May 18, 1977: "Indeed, the objective of the law of July 15, 1975, is to offer households throughout France before July 15, 1980, the possibility of eliminating their waste, without any nuisance, at the same time as an encouragement for the recovery and recycling of certain components of this waste, within the framework of a national policy of saving natural resources and energy"(p.1).

The importance of waste produced as close to the citizens as possible

Although municipal waste produced as close to the citizen as possible, represents at best only one tenth of the total amount of waste produced; its symbolic importance and value as an indicator of the quality of overall waste management at the national level has not escaped the attention of the European Union Commission, which expresses it in its (2018) directives. Considerations 6:

"Municipal waste accounts for about 7-10% of the total amount of waste produced in the European Union. However, this waste stream is one of the most complexes to manage. The way it is managed usually gives a good indication of the quality of a country's overall waste management system. The challenges associated with the management of municipal waste stream from the great complexity and diversity of the composition of the waste stream and the fact that waste is generated in close proximity"(p. 2).

Sorting as the first act of waste recovery

The European Union, in line with national ambitions, sets the objectives of the member countries' guidelines for the reuse and recycling of waste by sorting municipal waste at the source "by 2025 to increase to a minimum of 55% by weight". However, it is possible to achieve

a result "of at least 50% by 2025 if the deadline for achieving the target is extended" (Ibid, p. 22).

Studies on population behaviour with regards to waste are rare in France. Nevertheless, a quantitative and qualitative increase can be observed under various researchers' entries in human sciences related to waste. Some work focuses on the relations between populations and the management of their waste, e.g. The sociological work of Florian Charvonnin (2000) on sorting; the thesis of (Fiorello, 2011) in marketing on the behaviour of household waste sorting; the work of (Duprè, 2013) on the social representations of selective sorting in psychology, the sociology thesis of Cristina Nizzoli (2015) entitled Syndicalisms and workers at the "bottom of the ladder": CGT and CGIL to the test of cleanliness employees in Marseille (France) and Bologna (Italy), the sociology thesis of (Reyssat, 2015) entitled Domination and Resistance at Work: A Survey of the Body Experience of Cleaning Workers. These researchers demonstrate the complexity of the act of sorting, which is unfortunately taken for granted by society.

The persistence of waste as an obstacle to waste sorting and an indication that the Proximal Development Zone has not been taken into account.

However, this ambition of sorting waste for recovery is formulated while ignoring the progressive nature of the acquisition of skills that are promoted in the educational sciences. Sorting waste means taking into account at least two destinations, or two bins. The 1977 circular mentioned above devotes its fifth part to the presence of rubbish, most of which was produced by citizens who had not yet taken into account a destination or a bin for their waste. This circular suggested that "the development of municipal waste disposal services was likely to reduce uncontrolled dumping, as craftsmen, tradesmen and households will appreciate having a disposal site for their waste near them and will be less tempted to abandon them_" (Circular of 18/05/77, p. 6). Having said this, analogical reasoning that could illustrate the situation will be in the education system where 80% of pupils entering secondary school are said to have acquired the desirable academic skills. While 50% of the same age group are believed to be of the population who are considered illiterate, thinking that school is not enough to make them all literate.

Providing collection facilities available for citizens have proven to be not efficient in improving individual's behaviour on littered waste however the disposition of rubbish bins but, since the European Union's 2018 directive in its preliminary considerations 33, 34 and 35 stated that: "Waste, whether in cities, on land, in rivers, seas or elsewhere, have direct and indirect negative impacts on the environment, the well-being of citizens and the economy, and the costs

of cleaning it up constitute an unnecessary economic burden on society. " (European Union, 2018, p. 6). The increase in clean-up and waste collection by citizens on land, water and at sea, the launch of an international day dedicated to cleaning up the planet launched in 2018 by Estonia with the immediate adhesion of 150 countries show the reality of the non-use of a rubbish bin by a large number of citizens.

The failure to consider the fact that a significant part of the population continues to abandon waste at inappropriate spaces, the expectations placed on them to sort waste for recovery highlights a major pedagogical issue identified by Vygotsky (1934/2019). In his work "Language and Thought" Vygotsky highlighted the existence of a proximal zone of development in the field of learning and the acquisition of skills, which designates the difference between what [one] can achieve alone (one's current level of practice) and what [one] can achieve with help.

This theory is consistent with the Barthes (2017) study, which indicates that there is a "negation of the distance (which is generally recognized as necessary because it generates certain objectivity) between social practices and the knowledge to be taught [which] is a common posture in ESD, as shown in the course outlines based on examples of stakeholder practices or eco-efficiency approaches (e.g., waste sorting)" (p. 364). In the context of this article, the failure to take into account this distance between stakeholders' practices and the behavioural education that one would like to inculcate in them is a major pedagogical mistake committed in the educational approach for better waste management.

Dumping garbage in inappropriate spaces is a widespread and socially unacceptable practice.

The latest Ipsos study for the Vinci Foundation, published on August 1, 2019, reveals that 37% of road users throw waste out of their car windows. The experiment was carried out over several years, all at the same time of the year, and reveals persistent and shocking behaviour on motorists. Paradoxically, the presence of waste is considered inadmissible by 85% of the 1,060 people questioned, representative of French society. In a survey carried out by TNS Sofres (2006), a French polling company, on behalf of *Eco Emballage*, a company in the household packaging recycling sector, entitled "The French and littering."

The data of the Table 1 show on the level of intolerance of populations when they observe certain behaviours posed by others. There is enclosed a list of behaviours that we observe around us. The respondents were given some options to choose for each of them. The question

is tell me if you find it inadmissible, quite reprehensible, reprehensible but no more reprehensible or acceptable?

Table1

Intolerance of certain behaviours (slide 6)

Throwing litter in public places or the wilderness	85%
Leave leftovers and their packaging at the picnic site.	83%
Leave bulky objects (such as a couch, fridge) on the roadway.	77%
Graffiti on the wall of a public building	74%
Don't pick up your dog's droppings on the street.	60%
Spit on the floor	54%
Dispose of batteries with other waste	54%
Driving at 160 km/hour on a motorway	44%
Disturbing one's neighborhood by making noise	42%
Throw a piece of chewing gum on the floor	42%
Do not separate your household packaging waste.	37%
Throwing a cigarette butt on the sidewalk	36% »

Two forms of waste abandonment in the public space

The first one is hazardous waste, including "illegal dumping," i.e., waste that is intentionally collected and deposited in the wild or inappropriate locations by people who are unwilling, unable to get to the recycling center or other dedicated places. It has been reported that some people when arriving at the waste center to discover that the premises are closed, instead of returning home with their rubbish, choose to dispose them aside, in front, opposite or even a mile away from the center causing heaps and concern for the environment. Also, illegal dumping can sometimes be carried out by people who do not want to or cannot pay the costs of taking them to the drop-off center. For logistical and/or financial constraints or convenience, the concern people decide to dispose of the waste they have previously accumulated in non-dedicated areas. The second one is litter, also made up of garbage or rubbish, which seems to be the closest word in French to name a category of waste that has been built up over time. It is the act of throwing away or leaving small quantities of urban waste on the public highway without using the intended infrastructure, as summarized here by the Swiss Federal Office for the Environment (2019).

Sensitization actions to deal with poor waste management

Waste, when not trapped in the land, ends up in the sea by wind or runoff, as stated above. "Waste in the marine environment is a particularly urgent matter", according to the statement contained in the EU directive (already cited), which calls for "encouraging consumers to change their behaviour, in particular through education and sensitization campaigns" (p. 6). This is the only time the word education will be used in this directive in conjunction with the word campaign. In contrast, four times in this document, it refers to a sensitization campaign to prevent food waste production, for the prevention and reduction of waste in the natural and marine environments, for changing consumer behaviour, for separate collection and the introduction of these issues into education and training. The UE Directive deplors the lack of public sensitization, which is said to be at the root of illegal dumping by citizens.

The vocabulary used in the UE Directive to consider a change in behaviour is borrowed from the field of trading, where a campaign refers to a set of coherent marketing actions carried out over the same period of time and aimed at promoting the same product or service, and the term sensitization used in marketing refer to the repeated action that triggers a reaction following exposure to a substance or stimulus. The presence of this vocabulary in the field of environmental actions shows both ephemeral and targeted actions. If they are adapted to instinctive reactions such as a purchase or a donation during fundraising campaigns, a lasting change in behaviour requires coherent effort by the entire population of all ages and for all places, a new environmental culture.

Sensitization prioritized over transformative education

The pedagogue and historian Giolitto (1991) stated it about 30 years ago, and it the same issue in this paper: "it would not come to one's mind to say [about ecology] the word culture, and to pretend that general knowledge taught by educational institutions should add to its philosophical, literary, scientific or artistic dimensions a new dimension of environmental type. That represents for it [the environment] the only way not to be just of yesterday, but also and mainly of today, and to anticipate tomorrow" (p. 3).

We can find now that if we can say we are teaching ecology in school, this teaching has less ambition to integrate school culture. There is a posture generally admitted on waste management issues according to which one can just give directives, explain, inform, and put in place accessible management tools to solve waste issues. This also applies to the domain of waste management or of professional training, especially observed in the framework of research carried out in 2016 in the Paris region on the training of ambassadors of sorting recruited by

eco-citizenship educational associations on line with a syndicate of waste treatment for the account of its municipalities associated. Expectancies, in terms of training did not include the personal transformation of sorting ambassadors. Their sensitization action is oriented towards "others."

They just need to know how we can see it in the job ambassador sorting description: how do they sensitize the region's public to the prevention and sorting of household waste. Inform and sensitize on waste sorting to improve sorting quality and the number of materials collected for recycling, developing communication around prevention and waste sorting (Regional Agency for Biodiversity and the Environment, 2020). If waste management is a physical practice, the "facilitators" are not supposed to be practices but knowledge. Observation of pollution by the throwing of cigarettes butt by one of the sorting ambassadors trained in 2016 during a follow-up after training on the field of their professional life illustrates the procedure's incoherencies. They could compare this situation to that of the recruitment of a person who knows a sport but does not practice it to train the public for the sport's practice in question.

The "forgetfulness" of including cleaning and waste collection workers in the process of improving waste management

The multiplication of a one-off clean-up and sensitization actions aim to improve waste management. It is achieved by the exclusion and total invisibility of those responsible for dealing with waste after being adequately or inappropriately neglected the citizen who produced it. Desjonqueres (2019) reports carried out "in 2016 on behalf of the Directorate Research Studies and Statistics stated that "8% of employees in France metropolitan worked in the cleaning industry or involved in a cleaning activity" (p. 1). This high proportion of part-time or full-time "workers" in this sector was not sufficient for this category of employees to be identified in the recent information report submitted by members (Bonnell & Ruffin, 2020) to the National Assembly on the linkage professions. The report states that help from home, including; childcare assistants, childcare assistants for disabled children, and after-school care workers, are good jobs for the social bond. It denounces their precarious nature and proposes courses of action improve their work conditions. Nevertheless, Dussuet's survey in 2005 published on homecare services showed the importance of household chores that are generally invisible and carried out free of charge by women, which led her to communicate in 2010 on the relational function of the activity of "doing the housework." (Dussuet, 2005, 2010).

The assessment of the social utility induced by the recent global health crisis has reinforced the "waste workers" (Cortel & Le Lay, 2011) in an undeniable and somewhat

recognized utilitarian role. A "relative" recognition that does not seem to have gone beyond the period of the health crisis, since the demands of health care workers for an increase in remuneration and resources allocated to health have been the subject of consultations (Ministry of solidarity and Health, 2020) negotiations and substantial commitments (Ibid). Similarly, the demands for an increase in the premiums (Decree n° 2020-903 of July 24, 2020) of the fire brigades involved in the health crisis has been met. The world of workers in the waste sector is emerging from the period of confinement by a reminder of their reality through a tragedy of the wrong kind reported by the press. "Rubbish collector for 26 years and father of an 18-year-old child, Stefano Patry shot himself with a shotgun in his garage. His employer, who reproached him for having consumed, during his working hours, two beers offered by local residents who wanted to thank him and one of his colleagues [everyday heroes] for their commitment during his confinement. "Before firing him, they could perhaps have talked to him. This is not normal and we have to fight about it. We have to dialogue and move forward," says CGT union delegate Yannick Martin, who talks about redundancies and suicides in other waste collection companies" (Rostagnat, 2020 p. 1).

The waste workers, these agents of the "bottom of the ladder" defined in work coordinated by Cours-Salies and Le Lay (2006), give an account of the social construction of situations of subordination and their "damage" in the functioning of French society. These "bottom of the ladder" categories are also subject to social disqualification, which has been analyzed at length by Paugaum (1991/2009) since his first innovative work was published in 1991. He regularly re-evaluated based on a survey mainly conducted among populations occasionally or regularly assisted by social action.

Nizzoli (2015) pointed out in one of her surveys the precariousness of cleaning agents in an experiment that was done from a trade union office in France and Italy. This experiment powerfully outlines the presence of permanent subcontracting in this environment, leading to breaking the bond between workers instead of a permanent contract that will empower workers with stability and responsibilities. Therefore, these waste workers are concerned by the sociology of instability developed for several years by Maryse Bresson (2020) on the paths and processes of part of the population's precariousness.

The door-to-door waste collection agent, the main lever for improving waste sorting

As a result of the situation described above, waste collection agents would be the pivotal elements in improving behaviour during the implementation of door-to-door operations committed to sustainable development. The analysis of the selective performance obtained by

cities committed to the zero-waste approach, (2020) whose slogan is "the best waste is the waste that is not produced." It shows the predominance of an essential factor linked by the same aims between the product source, i.e., citizen and the collector.

This was an essential point that emerged from the four European cities' champions of zero waste (Passot, 2018). The cities mentioned are sparsely populated (between 3,000 and 300,000 inhabitants), and three of them go "door-to-door" for collection. The most crucial city committed to the zero-waste approach is the city of San Francisco, which aims to achieve its objective by relying on two strategies: the launch of new sorting technologies and financial incentives. Beyond the new technologies presented, the city seems far from having achieved its objective. Its commitment seems more declarative.

Feedback received (during the preparation seminar of the European Week for Waste Reduction (SERD) in Corsica held on October 15, 2019, and to a conference by Rossano Ercolini, President of Zero Waste Europe and Zero Waste Italy held on Saturday, January 11, 2020, in Corte) from boroughs that have introduced door-to-door waste collection show an improvement in the percentage of waste sorted. They reported that the transformation of their agents who are less absent, more interested in their work, and were soberer in their alcohol consumption, among others. On the population side, some inhabitants speak of a lively exchange with these agents who are now expected weekly and with whom "we talk about everything." The door-to-door service, which is challenging to implement and expensive, is also popular and desired (Corsica environmental office, 2019) by the Corsican community responsible for waste management on the island.

The pedagogical lighting of the success of the door-to-door waste collection

The pedagogical explanation for this success is the new role of the garbage collectors in the door-to-door collection of waste from citizens. The accomplishment of this task induces a change of position in the relationship of domination usually experienced. They do not limit themselves to the mechanical action of the collection; they assess the quality of the citizens' sorting on site and provide advice. This indeed is a change in the usual asymmetrical domination relationship experienced by these workers whereas one can perceive that before waste collection was in the dead-end of a situation that "does not work" according to the usual criteria for organizing this public action so that a change of perspective is envisioned" expressed by Bataille on the conditions for the emergence of decision pedagogies in his thesis on this concept (Bataille, 2010, p. 99).

The pedagogies of decision making are based on a process of social individuation, allowing them to develop the conditions which permit people to build common rules on the subjects that concern them. On the meaning of the social distinction beneficial to the entire social body of which Durkheim (1986) speaks in the division of social labor, « *society becomes more capable of moving together, at the same time that each of its elements has more movements of its own. This solidarity resembles that observed in higher animals. Each organ has its special physiognomy, its autonomy, and yet the unity of the organism is all the greater as this individuation of the parts is more marked*“(p.122). Workers in the waste sector contribute to rethinking the process not only of waste collection but also of getting citizens to make available waste that has been sorted for collection and therefore can be recovered. This change is far from insignificant since it involves overcoming the long period during which reports of discredit against these workers have been established.

Another pedagogical explanation for this approach's success will be that the citizen who manages their waste will receive adequate feedback on their practice. Hence, it is unthinkable to imagine a favorable outcome of any kind of education will be beneficial if the feedback evaluation is not done prior to a waste management practice. How can one imagine educating without the educated person knowing where they stand in the learning or knowledge process? How can one make progress without accurate feedback based on an indicator? This amounts to teaching without producing a process of self-evaluation or evaluation of teaching. When garbage collectors go door-to-door, they evaluate the quality of waste sorting presented by the citizen, who has feedback on his practice.

Another explanation would be the change of objective in the collection process. Before, they were just asked to recover what they were given to make the place clean of citizens' civility or incivility. Today, they participate in helping citizens to adopt appropriate practices. It is a change in the order of a person who would take care of keeping children in a given space that would be different from a person who would take care of a child's education by various means always in a given space. The latter person will have more interaction with the child in his or her care.

Garbage collectors engaged in a door-to-door approach are therefore included in an evaluation process where they produce indicators and find a place in the improvement of waste management, which has a significant impact on their work conditions. It is a process of action that, to be carried out successfully, leads to working with according to an approach developed by Sellenet (2006) in his work on the difficulties linked to parenthood in families. A work

"with," which is built on the opposite of a work "for" or "on," in processes "designed for" unfortunately very widespread in the social body and the daily life of waste workers.

However, the benefits of door-to-door collection, which is efficient and appreciated by the populations, are collapsing due to its implementation's high costs. Many towns that had implemented it are abandoning door-to-door collection (Triet, 2015), which has caused discontent among the population and prompted an investigation by the rights defender, who in 2017 launched a call for a testimony to understand the real benefit derived from this abandonment (Lenormand, 2017). The citizens' crisis meeting on January 11, 2020, in Corte (Lucioni, 2020) in the presence of Rossano Ercolini, a pioneer of zero waste in Europe, to deal with the waste emergency in Corsica, saw the intervention of a few municipalities. They showed their attraction for door-to-door collection but remained reluctant to commit themselves despite the aid (Corsica Community, 2018) promised for this type of collection, which they find unsustainable for their long-term budget at the end of the aid granted.

The reality of the precariousness and reduction of cleaning agents to the production of cleanliness at all costs

The agents in charge of cleaning or waste collection were interviewed in the course of this research, and they expressed the prescription that they have received to modify their practices because of their structure's environmental commitment to sustainable development. Most of them are orally informed, given sorting guides, summoned at best, and very rarely invited to sensitization with users to waste management according to the new standard. Thus, they are committed to an ideal achievement without being invited to think about the means to achieve it. None of the agents interviewed received any financial rewards or increased working time due to the extra time required to carry out these new practices. They are automatically committed to achieving this prescription of the ideal of urban cleanliness, as demonstrated (Le Lay & Corteel, 2014).

Observations and interviews conducted in schools at all levels, from preschool to university, including training centers, show a remoteness, confinement of cleanliness agents in the tasks of cleanliness, which then reflect their effectiveness in their function. Already in preschool, the job description of the ATSEM (Specialized Territorial Agent for Nursery Schools) indicates that they belong to the educational community. They assist the teacher in the reception and look after the hygiene of the children (pedagogical aid). Also, they help maintain the cleanliness of the premises and the equipment of the classes (Public employment information, 2020). In the reality of the urban field survey, no evidence was found of this staff's

involvement in school meetings or any effective or formal educational action. The same goes for the territorial technical assistants of educational institutions -ATTEE- who according to the statutory definition, belong to the educational community. They are in charge of the tasks necessary for the functioning of the material services of educational establishments, mainly in the fields of reception, maintenance of green spaces, accommodation, hygiene, maintenance of furniture and goods, catering and transport (Ministry of National Education Youth and Sports, 2020). However, Christine César (2006), following on from work carried out with other researchers. (César, Larguèze, & Gaubert, 2001) in the school environment. She has included these employees (mice) working for the national education system (mammoth) in the "bottom of the ladder" category identified in the book coordinated by Cours -Salies and Le Lay (2006).

The research work of Reyssat (2015) highlighted the relations of domination and the resistance they provoke in the work of cleaning. This research carried out in immersion as a cleaner in three companies - two cleaning companies and a nursery - sufficiently demonstrates the complexity of a broader framework in which this domination takes place (Barrois & Devette, 2017) report fragmented work with short durations for long working days with significant pressure on wages.

Segregation of clean-up workers and its disastrous consequences

However, as Guillaume Faburel (2013) has shown with the involvement of inhabitants in the construction of the city, underlined the lack of consideration of the knowledge of inhabitants as the "unthought" of participatory democracy. We can see in the field of sustainable waste management the lack of consideration of the relevant role and knowledge of waste workers. The perspective of the necessary and urgent improvement of waste management practices by the whole society for the follow-up of humanity seems, therefore, utopian.

The exclusion of workers in the waste sector, which is an occupational category present in all places of human life, limits the adaptation of society's behaviour. Thus, four consequences (non-exhaustive list) are identified in this article:

Less autonomy in the construction of self-confidence due to the less political and social recognition of cleaning workers in society.

As Honneth (2004) points out with regard to the demand for recognition by other members of society, "the individual learns to understand himself both as a person of personal worth and as a particular member of the social community as he gradually assures himself of the specific abilities and needs that constitute him as a person through the positive reactions he encounters in the generalized partner of the interaction"(p.134).

Although embarrassed and distressed by the presence of waste in inappropriate places, waste workers have come to believe that the presence of waste is, in fact, the purpose of their work. They say, "We get paid for it," echoing users who think they are paid to clean up waste left in inappropriate places. Many garbage collectors also leave garbage in inappropriate places and say that they will clean it up later in their work or that another garbage collector will do it. They perceive this abandoned garbage as necessary for their work. Two out of every six-building guards observed in 2017 admit to not cleaning the lobby, for which they are responsible daily on days when there is no waste on the floor, and to create an illusion. They scent the lobby with a product that is reminiscent of cleaning products. This suggests that they perceive their work as the result of the dirt's action and not of acceptable use of the space generating less immediate perceptible dirt.

In the cleaning sector, there is a defection of local people as working conditions deteriorate. The occupation of these functions by people already on the margins of "legitimate, visible, power" society creates fault lines and "segregation" that is not conducive to social cohesion. In big cities, these jobs are now reserved for those who have no other choice or are the most desperate, as a 2017 survey of neighborhood agencies specializing in work integration shows. These agencies operate in neighborhoods with a high concentration of low-rent housing where these employees, almost all of the foreign origin, are confronted with the daily cleaning of waste, urine, and excrement in the common areas of apartment buildings.

Three videos recordings of cleaners - the first in a cultural venue in a medium-sized town in northern France, the second in an airport in a medium-sized city in the south, and the last of a medium-sized town in Italy, which is recognized for its zero-waste approach - show cleaners collecting sorted waste in bins made available to the public and mixing it into a single "residual" bin. They are thus, in plain sight, canceling out the efforts made by users to facilitate the recovery of their waste.

Conclusion

Research in educational sciences on sustainable development examines the effects of its tagged conception under the economic lens, its strong political hold that carries legitimacy but generates injunctions, and implies numerous pedagogical adaptations and habits necessary for its implementation.

However, concerning the acquisition of individual waste management skills, this article has highlighted the importance of good management of our daily waste, given the urgency of the consequences of abandoning it in inappropriate spaces. Despite the pedagogical evidence of the

need to consider the proximal area of development demonstrated by Lev Vygotsky in 1934 to define achievable goals, behavioural expectations are placed beyond the real reach of many citizens. This important pedagogical mistake takes us away from the objective of waste recovery, which necessarily involves adopting selective waste sorting by the entire population. Nevertheless, the multiplication of sensitization actions to the detriment of a proper educational approach questions the reality of a transforming political and social ambition necessary to our adaptation for our survival.

It is incomprehensible to note that waste management is mainly envisaged in the maintenance of precariousness and the exclusion of cleaning workers in most employment places. However, the municipalities and structures that obtain good results in terms of recovery undertake to improve the role and the consideration of these cleaning agents. The current health crisis has, during the early weeks, thanks to the confinement experienced in different countries, highlighted these workers as part of our "everyday heroes" necessary for the functioning of society. Unfortunately, this "ephemeral" recognition did not extend to a financial revaluation of their work or improvement in their working conditions. As a result, they remain in a precarious and socially disqualified position. The "forgetfulness" of workers in the waste sector in the approach to sensitization actions on sustainable development is a handicap for adopting appropriate behaviour by society as a whole.

However, despite the realities mentioned above, waste workers would be, for the educational researcher, the privileged mediator of waste management education for the entire population. They represent 8% of the population of workers inserted in all places of human life. They are the ones whose transformation of the way they are viewed, and of their own view of their actions, would make it possible to envisage, from the "bottom of the ladder," a more inclusive society that is more respectful, through them, of the resources used that become waste. This is already the case in municipalities committed to the zero-waste approach and setting up a door-to-door collection.

A research orientation on an educational approach to co-construct is necessary. It would make it possible to adapt the pedagogical functions present in door-to-door waste collection. Their effectiveness is comparable to individual lessons that a teacher can give to a pupil, representing an unimaginable cost if they were to be reproduced on the whole population. Therefore, it is a question of co-constructing educational actions for mutual improvement over a long time for the entire population in all its living areas, relying in particular on the clean-up workers who participate daily in the sanitation of these areas.

References

- Barrois, A. & Devetter, F. X. (2017). Short durations, long days. Fragmentation of working time and pressure on wages. *La nouvelle revue du travail*, 11.
- Barthes, A. (2017). Hidden curriculum. In A. Barthes, J. M. Lange & N. Tutiaux-Guillon (Eds.), *Critical Dictionary of Issues and Concepts of "Education to"* (pp.360-368). l'Harmattan.
- Bataille, J. M. (2010). *Decision-making pedagogy: Deciding with the public in socio-cultural animation* [Ph.D. Thesis, the University of Paris west Nanterre]. <https://tel.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-01002123/document>
- Berger, M. & Gayet-Viaud, C. (2011). From politics as a thing to politics as an activity. Investigating the political future of ordinary experience. In M. Berger, D. Cefaï & C. Gayet-Viaud (Eds.), *Civil to political: ethnographies of living together* (pp. 9-24). PIE Peter Lang. <http://hdl.handle.net/2078.1/123981>
- Bonnell, B. & Ruffin, F. (2020, June 24). *Economic Affairs*. National Assembly. http://www.assemblee-nationale.fr/dyn/15/dossiers/metiers_du_lien_rap-info
- Bresson, M. (2020). *Sociology of precariousness* (3rd ed.). Armand Colin.
- Brundtland, G. H. (1987). *Our common future*. Oxford University Press
- César, C., Gaubert, C., & Larguèze, B. (2001). Distance to the school world, "autonomy of the child" and attendance of half-board: the disaffection of school canteens in the colleges of Seine-Saint-Denis. In M. Joubert, P. Chauvin, F. Fancy, V. Ringa (Eds.), *Precaution, risk and health* (pp.335-350). Berger-Levrault.
- César, C. (2006). National Education and workers: the mammoth and the mice? In P. Cours-Saliès, S. Le Lay (Eds.), *The bottom of the ladder. The social construction of subordinate situations* (pp. 97-107). ERES.
- Circular of (1977, May 18) relating to the household waste disposal service. Application of Title IV of Law n° 75-633 of 15 July 1975. https://aida.ineris.fr/consultation_document/8537
- Charvonnin, F. (2000). The intelligence of selective sorting. In A. Micaud, M. Peroni (Eds.), *What connects us* (pp. 261- 279). de l'Aube.
- Corsica Community. (2018). Report N° 2018/O2/350. Declination of the 2018-2021 waste action plan. The president of the executive council of Corsica. <https://www.isula.corsica/assemblea/docs/2018O2350-rapport-declinaison-du-Plan-d-actions-sur-les-dechets.pdf>

- Corsica Environmental Office. (2019, December 10). Le seul choix c'est le porte à porte généralisé [Tocc' à voi. Waste the only choices general door-to-door]. *Corse Net Infos*. https://www.oec.corsica/Tocc-a-Voi-Dechets-le-seul-choix-c-est-le-porte-a-porte-generalise_a2099.html
- Corteel, D., & Le Lay, S. (2011). *Waste workers*. Eres.
- Cours-Saliès, P., & Le Lay, S. (2006). *The bottom of the ladder. The social construction of subordinate situations*. Eres
- Decree 2020-903 (July 24). Revaluing the fire allowance allocated to professional firefighters. <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000042148192&categorieLien=id#:~:text=sapeurs%2Dpompiers%20professionnels-.D%C3%A9cret%20n%C2%B0%202020%2D903%20du%2024%20juillet%202020%20portant,allou%C3%A9%20aux%20sapeurs%2Dpompiers%20professionnels>
- Desjonquères, A. (2019). *Cleaning jobs: what types of jobs, what conditions? Work?* Dares.
- Door-to-door glass collection: the system is expensive at Hazebrouck. (2014, September 27). *La Voix du Nord*. <https://www.lavoixdunord.fr/art/region/collecte-du-verre-en-porte-a-porte-le-systeme-coute-ia18b47651n2402998>
- Durkheim, É. (1986). *De la division du travail social* [The division of labor in society]. (11th ed.). PUF.
- Dussuet, A. (2005). *Women's work: Surveys of home-based services*. L'Harmattan.
- Dussuet, A. (2010, September 2-3). *Cleaning up: A relational activity?* Communication at the International colloquium "The relational dimension of the service professions: gender concealment or gender revelation?". Lausanne. <https://www.unil.ch/files/live/sites/ceg/files/shared/TexteAnnieDussuet.pdf>
- Dupré, M. (2013). Social representations of selective sorting and waste according to the sorting practices. *Les Cahiers Internationaux de Psychologie Sociale*, 98(2), 173-209.
- European Union directive (2018, May 30) No 2018/851 Amending Directive 2008/98/EC on Waste.
- Faburel, G. (2013). The inhabitant and the knowledge of inhabiting it as unthinkable of participatory democracy. In V. Biau, M. Fenker, E. Macaire (Eds.), *Involvement of the inhabitants in the making of the city. Trades and practices in question* (pp 31-54). Les Cahiers.
- Fiorello, A. (2011). *Household waste sorting behaviour: a marketing approach* [Ph.D. Thesis

- Université de Nice-Sophia Antipolis]. <https://tel.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-00657765/document>
- Giolitto, P. (1991). For an environmental culture. *Aménagement et Nature*, 101, 3-5.
- Glaser, B. G., Strauss, A. (2017). *Discovering anchored theory: Qualitative research strategies*. Routledge.
- Honneth, A. (2004). Recognition Theory: A Draft. *Revue du MAUSS*, (1), 133-136.
- Lange, J. M. (2017). Education for sustainable development. In A. Barthes, J. M. Lange & N. Tutiaux-Guillon (Eds.), *Critical Dictionary of Issues and Concepts of "Education to"* (pp.82-91). l'harmattan.
- Le Lay, S., & Corteel, D. (2014). La mise en prescription parisienne de l'idéal de propreté. Quelle méthode ? Quels effets ? [The Parisian prescription of the ideal of cleanliness. Which method? What effects?]. *La nouvelle revue du travail*, 4, Article 4. <http://journals.openedition.org/nrt/1624> ; <https://doi.org/10.4000/nrt.1624>
- Lenormand, A. (2017, July 28). Garbage collection: Defender of rights calls on users to testify. *Bank of the Territories*. <https://www.banquedesterritoires.fr/collecte-des-ordures-menageres-le-defenseur-des-droits-appelle-les-usagers-temoigner>
- Lucioni, B.I. (2020, January 12). Citizen crisis meeting in the face of the waste emergency in Corsica / *Corse Matin*. <https://www.corsematin.com/articles/reunion-citoyenne-de-crise-face-a-lurgence-des-dechets-en-corse-98409>
- Malo, P. (2020, March 13). In China, surgical masks end up on the beaches. *Conso Globe*. <https://www.consoglobe.com/coronavirus-masques-chirurgicaux-cg>
- Martin, H (2020, June 29). Throwing cigarette ends and masks: the scourge. *Charente Libre* <https://www.charentelibre.fr/2020/06/29/jets-de-megots-et-de-masques-le-fleau,3615333.php>
- Ministry of Ecological and Inclusive Transition. (2020). *Directive (EU) No. 2018/851 of 30/05/18 amending Directive 2008/98/EC on waste*. https://aida.ineris.fr/consultation_document/40800
- Ministry of Ecological and Inclusive Transition. (2020, June). An information campaign against masks and gloves thrown to the ground. <https://www.ecologique-solidaire.gouv.fr/campagne-dinformation-contre-masques-et-gants-jetes-terre>
- Ministry of National Education, Youth, and Sports (2020, August 7). *Technical assistant for educational institutions*. <https://www.education.gouv.fr/adjoint-technique-des-etablissements-d-enseignement-10820>

- Ministry of Solidarity and Health. (2020, August 6). *Le Ségur de la santé : 50 jours de Consultations* [The Ségur of Health: 50 days of consultation].. <https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/systeme-de-sante-et-medico-social/segur-de-la-sante-les-conclusions/article/la-segur-de-la-sante-50-jours-de-concertation>
- Ministry of Solidarity and Health. (2020, August 6). *La Ségur de la santé: les conclusions* [The Ségur of health : The conclusions]. <https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/systeme-de-sante-et-medico-social/segur-de-la-sante-les-conclusions/>
- N'daricaling, L. (2020, June 10). Coronavirus: Protective gloves and masks pollute. The Mediterranean Sea. *TV5MONDE*. <https://information.tv5monde.com/video/coronavirus-gants-et-masques-de-protection-polluant-la-mediterranee>
- Nizzoli, C. (2015). *C'est du propre !* [It's clean!]. Presses Universitaires de France. <https://doi.org/10.3917/puf.nizzo.2015.01>
- On the road to the holidays, more than 1 in 3 French people throw rubbish out of their car window. (2019). *IPSOS*. <https://www.ipsos.com/fr-fr/sur-la-route-des-vacances-plus-d1-francais-sur-3-jette-des-dechets-par-la-fenetre-de-sa-voiture>
- Paugam, S. (2009). *Preface to the eighth edition. Social disqualification, twenty years later*. Presses Universitaires de France.
- Pedrosa, C. (2020, May 29). Zero waste: Biodegradable masks soon? *L'info durable*. <https://www.linfordurable.fr/technomedias/zero-dechet-bientot-des-masques-biodegradables-18143>
- Passot, A. (2018, October 29). These 4 European cities are champions of zero waste. *We Demain*. https://www.wedemain.fr/Ces-4-villes-europeennes-sont-des-championnes-du-zero-dechet_a3683.html
- Pennanec'h, P., & Lecalot, G. (2020, May 15). This crisis is bringing in more waste: The puzzle of recycling single-use masks. *France info*. https://www.francetvinfo.fr/sante/maladie/coronavirus/cette-crise-est-en-train-d-amener-des-dechets-supplementaires-le-casse-tete-du-recyclage-des-masques-a-usage-unique_3965747.html
- Regional Agency for Biodiversity and the Environment. (2020, August 7). *Sorting ambassador job description*. https://www.arpe-arb.org/fiche_metier.asp?MeNum=Me00000040
- Reyssat, F. (2015). *Dominance and resistance at work. A study about corporeal experience of*

- cleaning workers*. [Ph.D. Thesis, University Paris Diderot Paris 7]. <https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-01254516>
- Rostagnat, M. (2020, June 19) Caen: Strike called after the suicide of a garbage collector, sacked for drinking two beers. *BFM TV* https://www.bfmtv.com/societe/caen-appel-a-la-greve-apres-le-suicide-d-un-eboueur-licencie-pour-avoir-consomme-deux-bieres_AV-202006190019.html
- Sauvé, L. (2008). A strange attractor, a "barbarian invasion". *Pour*, 198, 46-54. <https://www.cairn.info/revue-pour-2008-3-page-46.htm>
- Sellenet, C. (2006). The complexity of foster care: a leitmotif in the field of childhood. *Dialogue*, 167(1), 51–60.
- Strauss, A. Corbin, J. (1994). Méthodologie de la théorie ancrée [Grounded theory Methodology]. *Manuel de recherche qualitative*, 17(1), 273-285.
- Swiss Federal Office for the Environment (2019, April 3) Littering <https://www.bafu.admin.ch/bafu/fr/home/themen/thema-abfall/abfall--fachinformationen/abfallpolitik-und-massnahmen/littering.html>
- The zero waste approach*. (2020, August 7). Zero Waste France. <https://www.zerowaste-france.org/demarche-zero-waste/>
- TNS Sofres (2006, June). *The French and littering* [PowerPoint slides]. SlideShare. https://www.tns-sofres.com/sites/default/files/280706_dechets.pdf
- Triet, K. (2015, December 12). Roannais waste. The abandonment of door-to-door collection to study. <https://www.leprogres.fr/loire/2015/12/12/1-abandon-de-la-collecte-en-porte-a-porte-a-l-etude>
- Vygotsky, L. (2019). *Thought and language*. Edition la dispute. (Original work published 1934).
- World Cleanup Day. (2020, August 5). "World Cleanup Day". <https://www.worldcleanupday.org/>
- Yacou, Y. & Lèveillé, A. (2020, May 31). Australian researchers create a biodegradable mask made from sugar cane residue. *Guadeloupe la 1ère*. <https://la1ere.francetvinfo.fr/guadeloupe/chercheurs-australiens-creent-masque-biodegradable-fabrique-partir-residus-canne-sucre-838094.html>